

Massachusetts Municipal Association Recommendations to the COVID-19 Reopening Advisory Board

Presentation by the MMA's Reopening Advisory Committee

Adam Chapdelaine (Chair) and Geoff Beckwith (Executive Director & CEO), on behalf of the MMA
May 13, 2020



Today's Presentation

1. **Cities & Towns Uniquely Positioned as Partners**
2. **Diverse Municipalities with Common Needs**
3. **Municipal Resources are Strained to the Limit**
4. **A Sustainable Reopening Driven by Public Health**
5. **Timely & Specific Guidance with High Benchmarks**
6. **Three Categories of Issues and Priorities:**
 - A) **Seasonal & Special Events, Programs and Services**
 - B) **Municipal Operations (“Non-Essential” & Others)**
 - C) **Municipal Enforcement of 3rd Parties**
7. **Cross-Cutting Municipal Needs for Reopening Success**
8. **Priorities for Our Long-Term Economic Recovery**
9. **Four Essential Factors for Reopening Success: Notice, Guidance, Resources, Enforcement**
10. **MMA’s Recovery Advisory Committee**
11. **Appendix: Matrix of Municipal Needs, Priorities and Recommendations**

Cities & Towns Uniquely Positioned as Partners

- **Local government is uniquely positioned, because communities are:**
 - 1) On the front lines fighting the pandemic** through public health, emergency response and social services;
 - 2) Maintaining and delivering essential services** that keep communities, households and essential businesses operating and build our economy; and
 - 3) Enforcing state and local guidelines and orders** with the public and businesses to contain the virus
- **These multi-faceted leadership responsibilities make local government essential to any successful reopening plan**
- **Cities & towns deeply appreciate the close partnership that the Baker-Polito Administration has with local leaders in the fight against the COVID-19 virus – continuing this partnership is more important than ever**



Diverse Municipalities with Common Needs

- **Our 351 cities and towns have widely varying demographics and challenges in managing and responding to the COVID-19 pandemic**
 - Dense urban areas and rural communities
 - Central service communities and bedroom suburbs
 - Older industrial cities and small resort communities dependent on tourism
 - Coastal communities and hilltowns in Central & Western Massachusetts
 - Large cities with full-time staff and small towns with volunteers and part-time leadership
- **All local governments in every corner of Massachusetts need strong public health guidance and expertise from the state, full access to the necessary resources to meet local challenges, and the flexibility and authority to manage their local governments**

Municipal Resources are Strained to the Limit

- **Cities and towns have mobilized during the COVID-19 emergency** – providing essential public health, emergency response and critical services for vulnerable populations
- **Communities have diverted budget resources and redeployed staff** to respond and lead during the pandemic
- **Local leaders have maintained vital essential services and created new delivery structures and governance methods** to continue operations
- **At the same time, communities are facing the deepest fiscal crisis in memory**, with deep losses in local revenues and local aid imperiled due to the state's massive revenue loss, jeopardizing municipal services that are critical to fighting COVID-19 and rebuilding our economy
- **Municipalities in every region need full funding and equal access to resources to implement the reopening process** – PPE, equipment, supplies, testing, expertise



A Sustainable Reopening Driven by Public Health

- **Municipal leaders want to phase-in economic and social re-engagement as thoughtfully and carefully as possible, driven by public health data above all**
- **Each phase should be informed by public health metrics, with widespread testing & tracing, closely monitored infection rates, hospitalizations, and ICU capacity**
- **A second COVID-19 surge would endanger our residents, employees and businesses, and devastate chances for near-term economic improvement and a manageable economic recovery**
- **Economic recovery for Main Street businesses and larger corporations will only be possible with strong public health policies and protections in the COVID-19 era**
- **Public support and alignment across all government, business and social sectors will be essential – a second surge and shutdown would undermine this confidence**



Timely & Specific Guidance with High Benchmarks

- **First and foremost, communities need timely, strong, clear and detailed guidance from the state on what will and what will not be allowed in each phase of the re-opening – including what specific conditions and actions will be required to ensure public health and safety, in each sector and segment of activity**
- **This includes clear guidance on:**
 - A) seasonal & special events, programs & services**
 - B) public-facing and customer-facing municipal services & operations**
 - C) 3rd party businesses and individuals subject to municipal enforcement**
- **State guidance should be directive and clear during each phase, with high benchmarks and requirements, and notice should be provided in advance of each phase – this will provide the necessary time to plan and verify that adequate resources are in place, facilitate consistency across communities in the public services offered, and ensure consistency and adequate capacity for local enforcement**

Timely & Specific Guidance with High Benchmarks

- **State guidance should be directive with clear and high standards** – this is necessary to reduce the magnitude of variance across Massachusetts and ensure consistency in the public services offered and the business and commercial activity allowed
- **Vague advisories or wide guidelines impose heavy policy and enforcement burdens on municipalities, creating border competition and asymmetrical spillover effects**
- **State directives should specify what activity is permitted in each phase, and what actions must be taken to operate safely and protect public health**
- **Cities and towns need early and timely notice well in advance of each reopening phase, including immediate guidance on seasonal & special events, services and programs** – these cross multiple phases; hiring, procurement & permitting are in process now (beaches, summer camps & recreation programs, concerts, swimming pools, holiday celebrations, e.g.)

A) Seasonal & Special Events, Programs and Services

Examples:

- State/Local Beaches (at the ocean and lakes)
- Summer Camp and Recreation Programs
- Municipal Swimming Pools
- Summer/Outdoor Concerts
- Holiday Events & Public Celebrations
- Permitting of Youth & Adult Sports/Activities
 - Use of Public Fields
 - Community Road Races
 - Scout Camping on Public Land

What's Needed:

- **Immediate notice prior to any phase**
 - Planning in process now
 - Activities span months/phases
- **Directive guidance with high benchmarks**
 - To facilitate consistency across state
- **Clear guidance for public and municipalities**
 - To ensure safe operations & compliance
- **Universal and equitable access to resources**
 - PPE, equipment, cleaning supplies, expertise & funding in every region

B) Municipal Operations (Non-Essential & Others)

- **Tier One (Public-Facing)**

- Elections
- Town Meetings
- Senior Centers (public programming)
- Libraries (public programming)
- Youth Centers
- Parks & Playgrounds
- Summer Camp & Recreation
- Use of Recreation Fields
- Municipal Golf Courses

- **Tier Two (Customer-Facing)**

- In-Person Payment of Bills (office)
- Inspections (office & in the field)
- Licensing (office & in the field)
- Senior Services (office & in the field)
- Veteran's Services (office & in the field)
- Permitting (office & in the field)
- Assessing (in the field)

- **Tier Three (Backoffice & WFH Options)**

- Accounting, Assessment, Finance, Operations/IT, Procurement, e.g.



B) Municipal Operations (Non-Essential & Others)

What's Needed:

- **Immediate notice for public-facing operations & vulnerable populations**
- **Timely notice in advance of each phase for other operations**
- **Specific guidance on how to operate safely in each phase**
 - Ensures consistency in public services and decision-making across the state
 - Reduces the burden of wide local variance and asymmetrical spillover effects
- **Universal and equitable access to resources**
 - PPE, equipment, cleaning supplies, testing for all public- and customer-facing municipal employees, technical expertise & funding in every region

C) Municipal Enforcement of 3rd Parties

Examples:

- Restaurants & Bars
- Lodging (Hotels, Motels, Short-Term)
- Personal Services
- Private Recreation & Clubs
 - Gyms, Large Venues, Golf Courses, Boys' & Girls' Clubs, YMCAs, Gun Clubs, Pool Clubs, Ice Rinks, e.g.
- Main Street Businesses
 - Retail, Office & Professional Services
- Industrial Operations & Large Workplaces
- Grocery Stores & Pharmacies
- Farmers Markets
- Construction (Commercial & Residential)

What's Needed:

- **Timely notice in advance of each phase**
- **Directive, clear & specific guidance with high benchmarks for 3rd party performance**
 - To facilitate consistency across state
 - To ensure ability & capacity to enforce
 - Low guidance will burden municipalities
- **Ensure clear local authority to enforce**
 - Option for verifiable & documented self-certification to ease local burden
 - Power to close until compliance achieved
 - Allowance for stronger local regulation
 - Complete information sharing from state
 - State affirms local authority to enforce

Cross-Cutting Municipal Needs for Reopening Success

- **Ubiquitous testing for all municipal employees and the public, coordinated by the state** – most towns & cities lack the medical facilities, resources & expertise to run local testing sites
- **Fully implemented contact tracing**, with state support to supplement local BOH capacity
- **Shelter, quarantine and isolation capacity for vulnerable populations**
- **Access to PPE, equipment and cleaning supplies for all municipalities in every region**
- **Access to localized health data to identify hotspots & outbreaks, & inform decisions** – this data is necessary to ensure public support & cooperation
- **Capacity to enforce reopening of private entities & conduct necessary inspections and reviews** – high benchmarks, specific directives, verifiable self-certification, local enforcement authority affirmed by state, ability to set stronger standards, complete & real-time information sharing by DLS and other state agencies

Cross-Cutting Municipal Needs for Reopening Success

- **High benchmark directives by the state to reduce the magnitude of variance** – vague advisories & wide guidelines impose heavy policy & enforcement burdens on cities and towns, create border competition and unwanted spillover effects
- **High benchmark directives and requirements for social distancing & PPE use by individuals** – vague or low-benchmark state standards would create an incentive for widely varied local regulation, which is inefficient and difficult to communicate and enforce
- **Coordination with state agencies and restoration of state services and operations** – for example, timely notification of DCR's decisions and operating guidelines on state beaches & land use, reopening courthouses to support local policing
- **Guidance on personnel and equity issues in role as the municipal employer** – including lack of access to childcare, those with underlying health issues, return to work policies

Priorities for Our Long-Term Economic Recovery

- **A second shutdown must be avoided** – our long-term economic recovery depends on phasing in a sustainable recovery plan that puts Massachusetts on track for a safe and uninterrupted restoration of business, social and governmental operations
- **Main Street businesses and downtowns will be key** – special investments & resources will be needed
- **Equity in reinvestment and recovery will be vital** – communities and regions with high unemployment, and concentrations of economically disadvantaged residents will need special focus
- **Cities and towns provide services that are fundamental to our economy, and we must avoid a fiscal crisis at all costs** – federal and state aid should fully reimburse all COVID-19 expenses, federal funding should be sent to replace lost local & state revenue, and municipal and education aid must be protected

Summary: 4 Essential Factors for Reopening Success

- **Timely Notice in Advance of Each Phase** – Cities and towns need timely notice of state directives, operational guidelines and policies in advance of each reopening phase to plan, prepare and verify that adequate resources are in place for implementation
- **Strong and Clear Directives and Standards in Each Phase** – State guidance should be directive with clear and high standards to reduce the magnitude of variance across Massachusetts and ensure consistency in the public services offered and the business and commercial activity allowed
- **Universal Access to Resources** – Municipalities in every region need equal access to the tools and resources to implement the reopening process and ensure equitable access to public services – PPE, equipment, cleaning supplies, testing access, technical expertise, funding sources
- **Clear Local Enforcement Authority** – The state should affirm local government's enforcement authority and ability to set stronger standards; the self-certification process should be documented and verifiable, with all DLS information shared in real time; local authorities should have power to close operations until compliance achieved



Thank you from the MMA's Reopening Advisory Committee


Adam Chapdelaine, Chair	Arlington Town Manager
John Mangiaratti	Acton Town Manager
Paul Bockelman	Amherst Town Manager
Andrew Flanagan	Andover Town Manager
Julie Jacobson	Auburn Town Manager
Mark Ells	Barnstable Town Manager
Kate Fitzpatrick	Needham Town Manager
Jon Mitchell	Mayor of New Bedford
Andrea Llamas	Town Administrator of Northfield
Jim Boudreau	Town Administrator of Scituate
Kevin Mizikar	Town Manager of Shrewsbury
Scott Galvin	Mayor of Woburn
Ed Augustus	Worcester City Manager
Geoff Beckwith	MMA Executive Director & CEO



APPENDIX:

MATRIX OF MUNICIPAL NEEDS, PRIORITIES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

MASSACHUSETTS MUNICIPAL ASSOCIATION REOPENING RECOMMENDATIONS

 <div> <div>MMA</div> <div>Massachusetts Municipal Association</div> </div>	A	B	C
	SEASONAL & SPECIAL EVENTS, PROGRAMS AND SERVICES	MUNICIPAL OPERATIONS ("NON-ESSENTIAL" & OTHER)	MUNICIPAL ENFORCEMENT OF 3RD PARTIES
1 NOTICE NEEDED	IMMEDIATE - PRIOR TO <u>ANY</u> REOPENING PHASE (these programs/events overlap phases; hiring, procurement & permitting in process; long-term guidance required)	IMMEDIATE FOR PUBLIC-FACING OPERATIONS & VULNERABLE POPULATIONS, OTHERWISE IN ADVANCE OF EACH PHASE	IN ADVANCE OF EACH PHASE
2 GUIDANCE NEEDED	DIRECTIVE & SPECIFIC (NOT ADVISORY) - IF PROGRAMS/ EVENTS ALLOWED SET A HIGH BENCHMARK TO FACILITATE CONSISTENCY	SPECIFIC GUIDANCE ON HOW TO OPERATE SAFELY IN EACH PHASE (ESPECIALLY PUBLIC-FACING)	DIRECTIVE & SPECIFIC (NOT ADVISORY) WITH HIGH BENCHMARK TO FACILITATE CONSISTENCY & ABILITY TO ENFORCE, LOCALS CAN DO MORE
3 RESOURCES NEEDED	CLEAR GUIDANCE FOR PUBLIC & MUNIS ON SAFE OPERATIONS; UNIVERSAL/EQUITABLE ACCESS TO PPE, EQUIPMENT, CLEANING SUPPLIES, EXPERTISE, FUNDING	UNIVERSAL/EQUITABLE ACCESS TO PPE, EQUIPMENT, CLEANING SUPPLIES, EXPERTISE, FUNDING FOR ADDITIONAL COSTS, TESTING FOR MUNI EMPLOYEES, ETC	SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS , AUTHORITY TO CLOSE FOR VIOLATIONS; OPTION FOR VERIFIABLE & DOCUMENTED SELF-CERTIFICATION

MASSACHUSETTS MUNICIPAL ASSOCIATION REOPENING RECOMMENDATIONS

	A	B	C
	SEASONAL & SPECIAL EVENTS, PROGRAMS AND SERVICES	MUNICIPAL OPERATIONS ("NON-ESSENTIAL" & OTHER)	MUNICIPAL ENFORCEMENT OF 3RD PARTIES
4 EXAMPLES OF MUNICIPAL PRIORITIES AND ACTION AREAS	EXAMPLES: State & Local Beaches (Ocean & Lakes) Summer Camp & Recreation Programs Municipal Swimming Pools Summer/Outdoor Concerts Holiday Events/Celebrations ... Memorial Day Parade ... Memorial Day Ceremony ... 4th of July Parade/Fireworks ... 4th of July Ceremony ... Labor Day Events Youth & Adult Sports/Activities ... Permitting Youth Baseball/Soccer ... Permitting for Adult Softball ... Permitting for Road Races ... Permitting for Scout Camping	EXAMPLES: <u>TIER ONE (Public Facing)</u> Elections Town Meetings Senior Centers Libraries Youth Centers Parks and Playgrounds Summer Camp & Recreation Programs Use of Recreation Fields Municipal Golf Courses <u>TIER TWO (Customer Facing)</u> ... In-Person Payment of Bills ... Inspections ... Licensing ... Senior Services ... Veteran's Services ... Permitting & Planning ... Assessing (in the field) <u>TIER THREE (WFH Options)</u> Back Office Operations ... Accounting ... Assessment ... Finance ... Operations/IT ... Procurement	EXAMPLES: Restaurants (Occupancy & Dining) Bars (Occupancy & Dining) Personal Services ... Hair & Nail Salons and Barber Shops ... Massage and Tatoo Services Private Recreation ... Gyms ... Large Event Venues ... YMCAs, Boys' & Girls' Clubs, Pools ... Private Golf Courses ... Gun Clubs ... Ice Rinks Main Street ... Retail Shops ... Office Buildings Construction ... Commercial ... Homeowner Industrial Operations/Large Workplaces Grocery Stores & Pharmacies Hotels, Motels, Short-Term Rentals Professional Services Farmers Markets Campgrounds

MASSACHUSETTS MUNICIPAL ASSOCIATION REOPENING RECOMMENDATIONS



A

**SEASONAL & SPECIAL
EVENTS, PROGRAMS
AND SERVICES**

B

**MUNICIPAL
OPERATIONS ("NON-
ESSENTIAL" & OTHER)**

C

**MUNICIPAL
ENFORCEMENT OF
3RD PARTIES**

5 CROSS-CUTTING MUNICIPAL NEEDS FOR SUCCESSFUL IMPLEMENTATION

A. UBIQUITOUS TESTING FOR ALL MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES AND THE PUBLIC

B. CONTACT TRACING (STATE SUPPORT TO SUPPLEMENT LOCAL HEALTH DEPARTMENT CAPACITY)

C. SHELTER, QUARANTINE AND ISOLATION CAPACITY FOR VULNERABLE POPULATIONS

D. ACCESS TO PPE & EQUIPMENT FOR ALL MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES IN EVERY REGION

E. ACCESS TO CLEANING & STERILIZATION SUPPLIES IN EVERY REGION

F. ACCESS TO LOCALIZED HEALTH DATA TO IDENTIFY HOTSPOTS & OUTBREAKS, INFORM DECISIONS

(recognizing underlying need for clear & transparent public health benchmarks and data-driven phases to ensure public cooperation & support)

G. CAPACITY TO PROCESS PERMITS/LICENSES/APPROVALS FOR REOPENING OF PRIVATE ENTITIES

(place burden on 3rd parties to certify compliance w/ state directives to avoid bottlenecks & overwhelming demands on local inspections & approvals)

H. HIGH BENCHMARK DIRECTIVES SET BY STATE TO REDUCE MAGNITUDE OF VARIANCE

(vague advisories and wide guidelines impose heavy policy & enforcement burdens on municipalities, creating border competition and spillover effects)

I. HIGH BENCHMARK AND REQUIREMENTS FOR SOCIAL DISTANCING & PPE USE BY INDIVIDUALS


(vague advisories and wide guidelines impose heavy policy & enforcement burdens on municipalities, creating border competition and spillover effects)

J. COORDINATION WITH STATE AGENCIES AND RESTORATION OF STATE SERVICES AND OPERATIONS

(Reopening of courthouses to support local policing, consistent DCR policies and enforcement, distribution of COVID-19 resources)

K. GUIDANCE ON EQUITY ISSUES AS EMPLOYERS (LACK OF CHILDCARE, UNDERLYING HEALTH ISSUES)

MASSACHUSETTS MUNICIPAL ASSOCIATION REOPENING RECOMMENDATIONS

	A	B	C
6 PRIORITIES FOR ECONOMIC RECOVERY	SEASONAL & SPECIAL EVENTS, PROGRAMS AND SERVICES	MUNICIPAL OPERATIONS ("NON-ESSENTIAL" & OTHER)	MUNICIPAL ENFORCEMENT OF 3RD PARTIES
	A. RESOURCES & ATTENTION TO MAIN STREET BUSINESSES AND DOWNTOWN RECOVERY		
	B. EQUITY IN REINVESTMENT & RECOVERY, ESPECIALLY TARGETING COMMUNITIES AND REGIONS WITH HIGH UNEMPLOYMENT, LOW-INCOME & MINORITY POPULATIONS		
	C. REIMBURSEMENT OF COVID-19 COSTS; PROTECTION OF STATE AID; REPLACEMENT OF LOST REVENUE		

MMA Final as of May 11, 2020